Introduced by Assembly Member Evans (Coauthors: Assembly Members Feuer and Tran)

(Coauthors: Senators Corbett and Harman)

December 1, 2008

An act to amend Sections 2016.020, 2031.010, 2031.020, 2031.030, 2031.040, 2031.050, 2031.060, 2031.210, 2031.220, 2031.230, 2031.240, 2031.250, 2031.260, 2031.270, 2031.280, 2031.290, 2031.300, 2031.310, and 2031.320 of, and to add Sections 1985.8 and 2031.285 to, the Code of Civil Procedure, relating to civil discovery, and declaring the urgency thereof, to take effect immediately.

LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

AB 5, as introduced, Evans. Civil discovery: Electronic Discovery Act.

The Civil Discovery Act permits a party to a civil action to obtain discovery, as specified, by inspecting documents, tangible things, and land or other property in the possession of any other party to the action. Existing law requires the party to whom an inspection demand has been directed to respond separately to each item or category of item by any of certain responses, including a statement that the party will comply with the particular demand for inspection by the date set for inspection pursuant to a specified provision.

This bill would establish procedures for a person to obtain discovery of electronically stored information, as defined, in addition to documents, tangible things, and land or other property, in the possession of any other party to the action. This bill would permit discovery by the means of copying, testing, or sampling, in addition to inspection,

 $AB 5 \qquad -2 -$

of documents, tangible things, land or other property, or electronically stored information.

The Civil Discovery Act permits the party demanding inspection and the responding party to agree to extend the time for service of a response to a set of inspection demands, or to particular items or categories of items in a set, to a date beyond that provided in a specified provision.

This bill would permit the parties to agree to extend the date for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling beyond those provided in specified provisions.

The Civil Discovery Act requires any documents produced in response to an inspection demand to be produced as they are kept in the usual course of business, or be organized and labeled to correspond with the categories in the demand. The documents are to be produced on the date described above or as agreed to by the parties pursuant to an extension.

This bill would make this provision applicable, in addition, to documents produced in response to a demand for copying, testing, or sampling. The bill would furthermore provide that if a party responding to a demand for production of electronically stored information objects to a specified form for producing the information, or if no form is specified in the demand, the responding party shall state in its response the form in which it intends to produce each type of information. In general if a demand for production does not specify a form or forms for producing a type of electronically stored information, the responding party would be required to produce the information in the form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a form that is reasonably usable, but need not produce the same electronically stored information in more than one form.

The bill would also provide that a party seeking a protective order regarding, or a party objecting to or opposing a demand for, production, inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of electronically stored information, on the basis that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of the undue burden or expense shall bear the burden of demonstrating that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense. If it is established that the electronically stored information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense, the court may nonetheless order discovery if the demanding party shows good cause, subject to specified restrictions in specified circumstances.

-3- AB 5

Existing law requires the court to impose a monetary sanction, as specified, against any party or any attorney of a party for specified violations.

This bill would generally provide that, notwithstanding the above provision, the court shall not impose sanctions on a party or any attorney of a party for failure to provide electronically stored information that has been lost, damaged, altered, or overwritten as the result of the routine, good faith operation of an electronic information system.

This bill would declare that it is to take effect immediately as an urgency statute.

Vote: $\frac{2}{3}$. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: no. State-mandated local program: no.

5

8

9

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

- 1 SECTION 1. This act shall be known as the Electronic 2 Discovery Act.
- 3 SEC. 2. Section 1985.8 is added to the Code of Civil Procedure, 4 to read:
 - 1985.8. (a) (1) A subpoena in a civil proceeding may require that electronically stored information, as defined in Section 2016.020, be produced and that the party serving the subpoena, or someone acting on the party's request, be permitted to inspect, copy, test, or sample the information.
 - (2) Any subpoena seeking electronically stored information shall comply with the requirements of this chapter.
 - (b) A party serving a subpoena requiring production of electronically stored information may specify the form or forms in which each type of information is to be produced.
 - (c) Unless the subpoenaing party and the subpoenaed party otherwise agree or the court otherwise orders, the following shall apply:
 - (1) If a subpoena requiring production of electronically stored information does not specify a form or forms for producing a type of electronically stored information, the person subpoenaed shall produce the information in the form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a form that is reasonably usable.
- 23 (2) A subpoenaed person need not produce the same 24 electronically stored information in more than one form.

AB 5 —4—

(d) The subpoenaed person opposing the production, inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of electronically stored information on the basis that information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense shall bear the burden of demonstrating that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense.

- (e) If the person from whom discovery of electronically stored information is subpoenaed establishes that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense, the court may nonetheless order discovery if the subpoenaing party shows good cause, subject to any limitations imposed under subdivision (h).
- (f) If the court finds good cause for the production of electronically stored information from a source that is not reasonably accessible, the court may set conditions for the discovery of the electronically stored information, including allocation of the expense of discovery.
- (g) If necessary, the subpoenaed person, at the reasonable expense of the subpoenaing party, shall, through detection devices, translate any data compilations included in the subpoena into a reasonably usable form.
- (h) The court shall limit the frequency or extent of discovery of electronically stored information, even from a source that is reasonably accessible, if the court determines that any of the following conditions exists:
- (1) It is possible to obtain the information from some other source that is more convenient, less burdensome, or less expensive.
- (2) The discovery sought is unreasonably cumulative or duplicative.
- (3) The party seeking discovery has had ample opportunity by discovery in the action to obtain the information sought.
- (4) The likely burden or expense of the proposed discovery outweighs the likely benefit, taking into account the amount in controversy, the resources of the parties, the importance of the issues in the litigation, and the importance of the requested discovery in resolving the issues.
- (i) If a subpoenaed person notifies the subpoenaing party that electronically stored information produced pursuant to a subpoena is subject to a claim of privilege or of protection as attorney work

-5- AB 5

product, as described in Section 2031.285, the provisions of Section 2031.285 shall apply.

- (j) A party serving a subpoena requiring the production of electronically stored information shall take reasonable steps to avoid imposing undue burden or expense on a person subject to the subpoena.
- (k) An order of the court requiring compliance with a subpoena issued under this section shall protect a person who is neither a party nor a party's officer from undue burden or expense resulting from compliance.
- (*l*) (1) Absent exceptional circumstances, the court shall not impose sanctions on a subpoenaed person or any attorney of a subpoenaed person for failure to provide electronically stored information that has been lost, damaged, altered, or overwritten as the result of the routine, good faith operation of an electronic information system.
- (2) This subdivision shall not be construed to alter any obligation to preserve discoverable information.
- SEC. 3. Section 2016.020 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
 - 2016.020. As used in this title:

- (a) "Action" includes a civil action and a special proceeding of a civil nature.
- (b) "Court" means the trial court in which the action is pending, unless otherwise specified.
- (c) "Document" and "writing" mean a writing, as defined in Section 250 of the Evidence Code.
- (d) "Electronic" means relating to technology having electrical, digital, magnetic, wireless, optical, electromagnetic, or similar capabilities.
- (e) "Electronically stored information" means information that is stored in an electronic medium.
- SEC. 4. Section 2031.010 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.010. (a) Any party may obtain discovery within the scope delimited by Chapters 2 (commencing with Section 2017.010) and 3 (commencing with Section 2017.710), and subject to the restrictions set forth in Chapter 5 (commencing with Section 2019.010), by inspecting, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* documents,
- 40 tangible things,—and land or other property—that are, and

-6-

electronically stored information in the possession, custody, or control of any other party to the action.

- (b) A party may demand that any other party produce and permit the party making the demand, or someone acting on that party's behalf, to inspect and to copy a document that is in the possession, custody, or control of the party on whom the demand is made.
- (c) A party may demand that any other party produce and permit the party making the demand, or someone acting on that party's behalf, to inspect and to photograph, test, or sample any tangible things that are in the possession, custody, or control of the party on whom the demand is made.
- (d) A party may demand that any other party allow the party making the demand, or someone acting on that party's behalf, to enter on any land or other property that is in the possession, custody, or control of the party on whom the demand is made, and to inspect and to measure, survey, photograph, test, or sample the land or other property, or any designated object or operation on it.
- (e) A party may demand that any other party produce and permit the party making the demand, or someone acting on that party's behalf, to inspect, copy, test, or sample electronically stored information in the possession, custody, or control of the party on whom demand is made.
- SEC. 5. Section 2031.020 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.020. (a) A defendant may make a demand for inspection, *copying, testing, or sampling* without leave of court at any time.
- (b) A plaintiff may make a demand for inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* without leave of court at any time that is 10 days after the service of the summons on, or appearance by, the party to whom the demand is directed, whichever occurs first.
- (c) Notwithstanding subdivision (b), in an unlawful detainer action or other proceeding under Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 1159) of Title 3 of Part 3, a plaintiff may make a demand for inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* without leave of court at any time that is five days after service of the summons on, or appearance by, the party to whom the demand is directed, whichever occurs first.
- (d) Notwithstanding subdivisions (b) and (c), on motion with or without notice, the court, for good cause shown, may grant leave

7 AB 5

to a plaintiff to make—an inspection a demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling at an earlier time.

- SEC. 6. Section 2031.030 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.030. (a) (1) A party demanding an inspection, copying, testing, or sampling shall number each set of demands consecutively.
- (2) A party demanding inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of electronically stored information may specify the form or forms in which each type of electronically stored information is to be produced.
- (b) In the first paragraph immediately below the title of the case, there shall appear the identity of the demanding party, the set number, and the identity of the responding party.
- (c) Each demand in a set shall be separately set forth, identified by number or letter, and shall do all of the following:
- (1) Designate the documents, tangible things,—or land or other property, or electronically stored information to be inspected, copied, tested, or sampled either by specifically describing each individual item or by reasonably particularizing each category of item.
- (2) Specify a reasonable time for the inspection, *copying, testing, or sampling* that is at least 30 days after service of the demand, unless the court for good cause shown has granted leave to specify an earlier date. In an unlawful detainer action or other proceeding under Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 1159) of Title 3 of Part 3, the demand shall specify a reasonable time for the inspection, *copying, testing, or sampling* that is at least five days after service of the demand, unless the court, for good cause shown, has granted leave to specify an earlier date.
- (3) Specify a reasonable place for making the inspection, copying, *testing*, *or sampling*, and performing any related activity.
- (4) Specify any *inspection, copying, testing, sampling, or* related activity that is being demanded in addition to an inspection and copying, as well as the manner in which that related activity will be performed, and whether that activity will permanently alter or destroy the item involved.
- 38 SEC. 7. Section 2031.040 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:

AB 5 —8—

2031.040. The party—demanding—an making a demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling shall serve a copy of the inspection demand on the party to whom it is directed and on all other parties who have appeared in the action.

- SEC. 8. Section 2031.050 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.050. (a) In addition to the inspection demands for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling permitted by this chapter, a party may propound a supplemental demand to inspect, copy, test, or sample any later acquired or discovered documents, tangible things, or land or other property that are, or electronically stored information in the possession, custody, or control of the party on whom the demand is made.
- (b) A party may propound a supplemental inspection demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling twice before the initial setting of a trial date, and, subject to the time limits on discovery proceedings and motions provided in Chapter 8 (commencing with Section 2024.010), once after the initial setting of a trial date.
- (c) Notwithstanding subdivisions (a) and (b), on motion, for good cause shown, the court may grant leave to a party to propound an additional number of supplemental demands for inspection, *copying, testing, or sampling*.
- SEC. 9. Section 2031.060 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.060. (a) When an inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* of documents, tangible things-or, places, *or electronically stored information* has been demanded, the party to whom the demand has been directed, and any other party or affected person or organization, may promptly move for a protective order. This motion shall be accompanied by a meet and confer declaration under Section 2016.040.
- (b) The court, for good cause shown, may make any order that justice requires to protect any party or other—natural person—or organization from unwarranted annoyance, embarrassment, or oppression, or undue burden and expense. This protective order may include, but is not limited to, one or more of the following directions:
- (1) That all or some of the items or categories of items in the inspection demand need not be produced or made available at all.

-9- AB 5

(2) That the time specified in Section 2030.260 to respond to the set of inspection demands, or to a particular item or category in the set, be extended.

- (3) That the place of production be other than that specified in the inspection demand.
- (4) That the inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* be made only on specified terms and conditions.
- (5) That a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information not be disclosed, or be disclosed only to specified persons or only in a specified way.
- (6) That the items produced be sealed and thereafter opened only on order of the court.
- (c) The party or affected person who seeks a protective order regarding the production, inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of electronically stored information on the basis that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense shall bear the burden of demonstrating that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense.
- (d) If the party or affected person from whom discovery of electronically stored information is sought establishes that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense, the court may nonetheless order discovery if the demanding party shows good cause, subject to any limitations imposed under subdivision (f).
- (e) If the court finds good cause for the production of electronically stored information from a source that is not reasonably accessible, the court may set conditions for the discovery of the electronically stored information, including allocation of the expense of discovery.
- (f) The court shall limit the frequency or extent of discovery of electronically stored information, even from a source that is reasonably accessible, if the court determines that any of the following conditions exist:
- (1) It is possible to obtain the information from some other source that is more convenient, less burdensome, or less expensive.
- (2) The discovery sought is unreasonably cumulative or duplicative.
- *(3)* The party seeking discovery has had ample opportunity by discovery in the action to obtain the information sought.

AB 5 -10-

(4) The likely burden or expense of the proposed discovery outweighs the likely benefit, taking into account the amount in controversy, the resources of the parties, the importance of the issues in the litigation, and the importance of the requested discovery in resolving the issues.

(e)

- (g) If the motion for a protective order is denied in whole or in part, the court may order that the party to whom the demand was directed provide or permit the discovery against which protection was sought on terms and conditions that are just.
 - (d) The
- (h) Except as provided in subdivision (i), the court shall impose a monetary sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010) against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion for a protective order, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.
- (i) (1) Notwithstanding subdivision (h), absent exceptional circumstances, the court shall not impose sanctions on a party or any attorney of a party for failure to provide electronically stored information that has been lost, damaged, altered, or overwritten as the result of the routine, good faith operation of an electronic information system.
- (2) This subdivision shall not be construed to alter any obligation to preserve discoverable information.
- SEC. 10. Section 2031.210 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.210. (a) The party to whom-an inspection *a* demand *for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling* has been directed shall respond separately to each item or category of item by any of the following:
- (1) A statement that the party will comply with the particular demand for inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* by the date set for *the* inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* pursuant to paragraph (2) of subdivision (c) of Section 2031.030 and any related activities.
- (2) A representation that the party lacks the ability to comply with the demand for inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* of a particular item or category of item.

-11- AB 5

(3) An objection to the particular demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling.

- (b) In the first paragraph of the response immediately below the title of the case, there shall appear the identity of the responding party, the set number, and the identity of the demanding party.
- (c) Each statement of compliance, each representation, and each objection in the response shall bear the same number and be in the same sequence as the corresponding item or category in the demand, but the text of that item or category need not be repeated.
- (d) If a party objects to the discovery of electronically stored information on the grounds that it is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense and that the responding party will not search the source in the absence of an agreement with the demanding party or court order, the responding party shall identify in its response the types or categories of sources of electronically stored information that it asserts are not reasonably accessible. By objecting and identifying information of a type or category of source or sources that are not reasonably accessible, the responding party preserves any objections it may have relating to that electronically stored information.
- SEC. 11. Section 2031.220 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:

2031.220. A statement that the party to whom an inspection a demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling has been directed will comply with the particular demand shall state that the production, inspection, copying, testing, or sampling, and related activity demanded, will be allowed either in whole or in part, and that all documents or things in the demanded category that are in the possession, custody, or control of that party and to which no objection is being made will be included in the production.

SEC. 12. Section 2031.230 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:

2031.230. A representation of inability to comply with the particular demand for inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* shall affirm that a diligent search and a reasonable inquiry has been made in an effort to comply with that demand. This statement shall also specify whether the inability to comply is because the particular item or category has never existed, has been destroyed,

 $AB 5 \qquad -12 -$

1 has been lost, misplaced, or stolen, or has never been, or is no 2 longer, in the possession, custody, or control of the responding 3 party. The statement shall set forth the name and address of any 4 natural person or organization known or believed by that party to 5 have possession, custody, or control of that item or category of 6 item.

- SEC. 13. Section 2031.240 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.240. (a) If only part of an item or category of item in-an inspection a demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling is objectionable, the response shall contain a statement of compliance, or a representation of inability to comply with respect to the remainder of that item or category.
- (b) If the responding party objects to the demand for inspection, *copying, testing, or sampling* of an item or category of item, the response shall do both of the following:
- (1) Identify with particularity any document, tangible thing, or land, or electronically stored information falling within any category of item in the demand to which an objection is being made.
- (2) Set forth clearly the extent of, and the specific ground for, the objection. If an objection is based on a claim of privilege, the particular privilege invoked shall be stated. If an objection is based on a claim that the information sought is protected work product under Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 2018.010), that claim shall be expressly asserted.
- SEC. 14. Section 2031.250 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.250. (a) The party to whom the demand for inspection, *copying, testing, or sampling* is directed shall sign the response under oath unless the response contains only objections.
- (b) If that party is a public or private corporation or a partnership or association or governmental agency, one of its officers or agents shall sign the response under oath on behalf of that party. If the officer or agent signing the response on behalf of that party is an attorney acting in that capacity for a party, that party waives any lawyer-client privilege and any protection for work product under Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 2018.010) during any subsequent discovery from that attorney concerning the identity of the sources of the information contained in the response.

-13-**AB** 5

(c) The attorney for the responding party shall sign any responses that contain an objection.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

- SEC. 15. Section 2031.260 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.260. (a) Within 30 days after service of an inspection a demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling, the party to whom the demand is directed shall serve the original of the response to it on the party making the demand, and a copy of the response on all other parties who have appeared in the action, unless on motion of the party making the demand, the court has shortened the time for response, or unless on motion of the party to whom the demand has been directed, the court has extended the time for response.
- (b) Notwithstanding subdivision (a), in an unlawful detainer action or other proceeding under Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 1159) of Title 3 of Part 3, the party to whom-an inspection a demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling is directed shall have at least five days from the date of service of the demand to respond, unless on motion of the party making the demand, the court has shortened the time for the response, or unless on motion of the party to whom the demand has been directed, the court has extended the time for response.
- SEC. 16. Section 2031.270 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.270. (a) The party demanding—an inspection, copying, testing, or sampling and the responding party may agree to extend the date for the inspection, copying, testing, or sampling or the time for service of a response to a set of inspection demands, or to particular items or categories of items in a set, to a date or dates beyond those provided in Sections 2031.030, 2031.210, 2031.260, and 2031.280.
- (b) This agreement may be informal, but it shall be confirmed in a writing that specifies the extended date for inspection, *copying*, testing, or sampling, or for the service of a response.
- (c) Unless this agreement expressly states otherwise, it is effective to preserve to the responding party the right to respond to any item or category of item in the demand to which the agreement applies in any manner specified in Sections 2031.210,

AB 5 — 14 —

SEC. 17. Section 2031.280 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:

- 2031.280. (a) Any documents produced in response to—an inspection a demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling shall either be produced as they are kept in the usual course of business, or be organized and labeled to correspond with the categories in the demand.
- (b) The documents shall be produced on the date specified in the inspection demand pursuant to paragraph (2) of subdivision (c) of Section 2031.030, unless an objection has been made to that date. If the date for inspection has been extended pursuant to Section 2031.270, the documents shall be produced on the date agreed to pursuant to that section.
- (c) If a party responding to a demand for production of electronically stored information objects to a specified form for producing the information, or if no form is specified in the demand, the responding party shall state in its response the form in which it intends to produce each type of information.
- (d) Unless the parties otherwise agree or the court otherwise orders, the following shall apply:
- (1) If a demand for production does not specify a form or forms for producing a type of electronically stored information, the responding party shall produce the information in the form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a form that is reasonably usable.
- (2) A party need not produce the same electronically stored information in more than one form.

(c)

- (e) If necessary, the responding party at the reasonable expense of the demanding party shall, through detection devices, translate any data compilations included in the demand into reasonably usable form.
- SEC. 18. Section 2031.285 is added to the Code of Civil Procedure, to read:
- 2031.285. (a) If electronically stored information produced in discovery is subject to a claim of privilege or of protection as attorney work product, the party making the claim may notify any party that received the information of the claim and the basis for the claim.

-15- AB 5

(b) After being notified of a claim of privilege or of protection under subdivision (a), a party that received the information shall immediately sequester the information and either return the specified information and any copies that may exist or present the information to the court conditionally under seal for a determination of the claim.

- (c) (1) Prior to the resolution of the motion brought under subdivision (d), a party shall be precluded from using or disclosing the specified information until the claim of privilege is resolved.
- (2) A party who received and disclosed the information before being notified of a claim of privilege or of protection under subdivision (a) shall, after that notification, immediately take reasonable steps to retrieve the information.
- (d) (1) If the receiving party contests the legitimacy of a claim of privilege or protection, he or she may seek a determination of the claim from the court by making a motion within 30 days of receiving the claim and presenting the information to the court conditionally under seal.
- (2) Until the legitimacy of the claim of privilege or protection is resolved, the receiving party shall preserve the information and keep it confidential and shall be precluded from using the information in any manner.
- SEC. 19. Section 2031.290 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.290. (a) The inspection demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling, and the response to it, shall not be filed with the court.
- (b) The party demanding an inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* shall retain both the original of the inspection demand, with the original proof of service affixed to it, and the original of the sworn response until six months after final disposition of the action. At that time, both originals may be destroyed, unless the court, on motion of any party and for good cause shown, orders that the originals be preserved for a longer period.
- SEC. 20. Section 2031.300 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 2031.300. If a party to whom—an inspection a demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling is directed fails to serve a timely response to it, the following rules shall apply:

AB 5 -16-

(a) The party to whom the inspection demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling is directed waives any objection to the demand, including one based on privilege or on the protection for work product under Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 2018.010). The court, on motion, may relieve that party from this waiver on its determination that both of the following conditions are satisfied:

- (1) The party has subsequently served a response that is in substantial compliance with Sections 2031.210, 2031.220, 2031.230, 2031.240, and 2031.280.
- (2) The party's failure to serve a timely response was the result of mistake, inadvertence, or excusable neglect.
- (b) The party making the demand may move for an order compelling response to the inspection demand.
- (c) The Except as provided in subdivision (d), the court shall impose a monetary sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010) against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel a response to—an inspection a demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust. If a party then fails to obey the order compelling a response, the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010). In lieu of or in addition to this sanction, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010).
- (d) (1) Notwithstanding subdivision (c), absent exceptional circumstances, the court shall not impose sanctions on a party or any attorney of a party for failure to provide electronically stored information that has been lost, damaged, altered, or overwritten as a result of the routine, good faith operation of an electronic information system.
- (2) This subdivision shall not be construed to alter any obligation to preserve discoverable information.
- 37 SEC. 21. Section 2031.310 of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:
- 39 2031.310. (a) On receipt of a response to an inspection a 40 demand for inspection, copying, testing, or sampling, the

-17- AB 5

demanding party-demanding an inspection may move for an order compelling further response to the demand if the demanding party deems that any of the following apply:

- (1) A statement of compliance with the demand is incomplete.
- (2) A representation of inability to comply is inadequate, incomplete, or evasive.
 - (3) An objection in the response is without merit or too general.
- (b) A motion under subdivision (a) shall comply with both of the following:
- (1) The motion shall set forth specific facts showing good cause justifying the discovery sought by the inspection demand.
- (2) The motion shall be accompanied by a meet and confer declaration under Section 2016.040.
- (c) Unless notice of this motion is given within 45 days of the service of the response, or any supplemental response, or on or before any specific later date to which the demanding party and the responding party have agreed in writing, the demanding party waives any right to compel a further response to the inspection demand.
- (d) In a motion under subdivision (a) relating to the production of electronically stored information, the party or affected person objecting to or opposing the production, inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of electronically stored information on the basis that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of the undue burden or expense shall bear the burden of demonstrating that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or expense.
- (e) If the party or affected person from whom discovery of electronically stored information is sought establishes that the information is from a source that is not reasonably accessible because of the undue burden or expense, the court may nonetheless order discovery if the demanding party shows good cause, subject to any limitations imposed under subdivision (g).
- (f) If the court finds good cause for the production of electronically stored information from a source that is not reasonably accessible, the court may set conditions for the discovery of the electronically stored information, including allocation of the expense of discovery.
- (g) The court shall limit the frequency or extent of discovery of electronically stored information, even from a source that is

—18 — **AB** 5

1 reasonably accessible, if the court determines that any of the 2 following conditions exists:

- (1) It is possible to obtain the information from some other source that is more convenient, less burdensome, or less expensive.
- (2) The discovery sought is unreasonably cumulative or duplicative.
- (3) The party seeking discovery has had ample opportunity by discovery in the action to obtain the information sought.
- (4) The likely burden or expense of the proposed discovery outweighs the likely benefit, taking into account the amount in controversy, the resources of the parties, the importance of the issues in the litigation, and the importance of the requested discovery in resolving the issues.

(d) The

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12 13

14 15

16 17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

37

(h) Except as provided in subdivision (j), the court shall impose a monetary sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010) against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel further response to an inspection a demand, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(e) If

- (i) Except as provided in subdivision (j), if a party fails to obey an order compelling further response, the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010). In lieu of or in addition to that sanction, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010).
- (j) (1) Notwithstanding subdivisions (h) and (i), absent exceptional circumstances, the court shall not impose sanctions on a party or any attorney of a party for failure to provide electronically stored information that has been lost, damaged, altered, or overwritten as the result of the routine, good faith operation of an electronic information system.
- (2) This subdivision shall not be construed to alter any 36 obligation to preserve discoverable information.
- 38 SEC. 22. Section 2031.320 of the Code of Civil Procedure is 39 amended to read:

-19- AB 5

2031.320. (a) If a party filing a response to a demand for inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* under—Section Sections 2031.210, 2031.220, 2031.230, 2031.240, and 2031.280 thereafter fails to permit the inspection, *copying*, *testing*, *or sampling* in accordance with that party's statement of compliance, the *demanding* party demanding the inspection may move for an order compelling compliance.

- (b) The-Except as provided in subdivision (d), the court shall impose a monetary sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010) against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel compliance with-an inspection a demand, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.
- (c) If Except as provided in subdivision (d), if a party then fails to obey an order compelling inspection, copying, testing, or sampling, the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010). In lieu of or in addition to that sanction, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Chapter 7 (commencing with Section 2023.010).
- (d) (1) Notwithstanding subdivisions (b) and (c), absent exceptional circumstances, the court shall not impose sanctions on a party or any attorney of a party for failure to provide electronically stored information that has been lost, damaged, altered, or overwritten as the result of the routine, good faith operation of an electronic information system.
- (2) This subdivision shall not be construed to alter any obligation to preserve discoverable information.
- SEC. 23. This act is an urgency statute necessary for the immediate preservation of the public peace, health, or safety within the meaning of Article IV of the Constitution and shall go into immediate effect. The facts constituting the necessity are:
- In order to eliminate uncertainty and confusion regarding the discovery of electronically stored information, and thereby minimize unnecessary and costly litigation that adversely impacts

AB 5 — 20 —

- 1 access to the courts, it is necessary for this act to take effect
- 2 immediately.